## FOCUSING ON JOB QUALITY

Anmol Chaddha<br>Anjali Sakaria<br>Federal Reserve Bank of Boston

April 9, 2018

The views expressed in this presentation are those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent the views of the Federal Reserve Bank of Boston or the Federal Reserve System.

## Wage Polarization

## Hourly wages of workers by wage percentile



## Widening Inequality

Growth in wages since 1979


## What Jobs are Growing?

Panel A. Smoothed changes in employment by skill percentile, 1980-2005


## Disappearing Good Jobs



## Public Costs of Low-Wage Jobs

Annual enrollment in Public Assistance Programs by Working Families, 2009-2011

|  | Medicaid/CHIP | EITC | SNAP |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Alabama | 444,000 | 435,000 | 215,000 |
| Florida | $1,765,000$ | $1,604,000$ | 739,000 |
| Georgia | 945,000 | 860,000 | 389,000 |
| Louisiana | 550,000 | 416,000 | 176,000 |
| Mississippi | 305,000 | 289,000 | 134,000 |
| Tennessee | 694,000 | 493,000 | 296,000 |

## Public Costs of Low-Wage Jobs

Annual cost of public assistance programs for working families, 2009-2011 (\$ millions)

|  | Federal Cost |  | State Cost |  |  |  |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
|  | Total cost | Working <br> family <br> portion | Working <br> family <br> share | Total cost | Working <br> family <br> portion | Working <br> family <br> share |
| Alabama | $\$ 4,152$ | $\$ 2,501$ | $60 \%$ | $\$ 373$ | $\$ 201$ | $54 \%$ |
| Florida | $\$ 13,399$ | $\$ 7,776$ | $58 \%$ | $\$ 2,007$ | $\$ 1,027$ | $51 \%$ |
| Georgia | $\$ 8,600$ | $\$ 5,045$ | $59 \%$ | $\$ 1,042$ | $\$ 539$ | $52 \%$ |
| Louisiana | $\$ 4,476$ | $\$ 2,504$ | $56 \%$ | $\$ 459$ | $\$ 236$ | $51 \%$ |
| Mississippi | $\$ 3,233$ | $\$ 1,755$ | $54 \%$ | $\$ 253$ | $\$ 122$ | $48 \%$ |
| Tennessee | $\$ 7,024$ | $\$ 3,945$ | $56 \%$ | $\$ 1,271$ | $\$ 709$ | $56 \%$ |

## How much of the workforce makes less than \$15?

|  | Alabama | Florida | Georgia | Louisiana | Mississippi | Tennessee |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| All workers | $46 \%$ | $46 \%$ | $43 \%$ | $45 \%$ | $50 \%$ | $46 \%$ |

## How much of the workforce makes less than \$15?

|  | Alabama | Florida | Georgia | Louisiana | Mississippi | Tennessee |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| All workers | $46 \%$ | $46 \%$ | $43 \%$ | $45 \%$ | $50 \%$ | $46 \%$ |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Male | $39 \%$ | $43 \%$ | $39 \%$ | $37 \%$ | $42 \%$ | $42 \%$ |
| Female | $52 \%$ | $49 \%$ | $46 \%$ | $54 \%$ | $56 \%$ | $50 \%$ |
| White | $40 \%$ | $38 \%$ | $35 \%$ | $37 \%$ | $40 \%$ | $42 \%$ |
| Black | $57 \%$ | $56 \%$ | $50 \%$ | $61 \%$ | $63 \%$ | $56 \%$ |
| Latino | $71 \%$ | $56 \%$ | $65 \%$ | $62 \%$ | $58 \%$ | $66 \%$ |

## How much of the workforce makes less than \$15?

|  | Atlanta | Miami | Nashville | New Orleans | Jacksonville | Birmingham |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| All workers | $37 \%$ | $46 \%$ | $41 \%$ | $42 \%$ | $40 \%$ | $40 \%$ |

## How much of the workforce makes less than \$15?

|  | Atlanta | Miami | Nashville | New Orleans | Jacksonville | Birmingham |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| All workers | $37 \%$ | $46 \%$ | $41 \%$ | $42 \%$ | $40 \%$ | $40 \%$ |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Male | $35 \%$ | $43 \%$ | $37 \%$ | $34 \%$ | $36 \%$ | $36 \%$ |
| Female | $39 \%$ | $49 \%$ | $44 \%$ | $49 \%$ | $43 \%$ | $44 \%$ |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| White | $28 \%$ | $30 \%$ | $36 \%$ | $33 \%$ | $36 \%$ | $35 \%$ |
| Black | $43 \%$ | $54 \%$ | $52 \%$ | $53 \%$ | $51 \%$ | $48 \%$ |
| Latino | $63 \%$ | $52 \%$ | $62 \%$ | $59 \%$ | $45 \%$ | $65 \%$ |

Source: American Community Survey 2016

## Majority of workers under \$15 are women



## Disproportionately Black \& Latino



Source: American Community Survey 2016

## Educational Attainment of sub-\$15 workforce



Source: American Community Survey 2016

## Vast majority are adults, not teens



Source: American Community Survey 2016

## Most are primary earners

Average share of Total Family Income Provided by Worker Making Under \$15/hour


## Large share are parents



Source: American Community Survey 2016

## Most are full-time workers



Source: American Community Survey 2016

## Key Industries

| INDUSTRIES | AL | FL | GA | LA | MS | TN |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Retail | $17.7 \%$ | $18.9 \%$ | $17.1 \%$ | $16.7 \%$ | $15.9 \%$ | $17.4 \%$ |
|  <br> Social Assistance | $15.3 \%$ | $12.3 \%$ | $11.2 \%$ | $16.7 \%$ | $15.2 \%$ | $12.9 \%$ |
| Restaurants | $12.6 \%$ | $16.1 \%$ | $14.4 \%$ | $14.7 \%$ | $12.2 \%$ | $13.7 \%$ |

## Quality Jobs Initiative

$\square$ Upgrading workers or Upgrading jobs?
$\square$ Manufacturing jobs became good jobs.
$\square$ How to improve job quality?


## Defining a ‘Quality Job’

$\square$ Wages
$\square$ Access to benefits

- Health, retirement, sick leave, family \& medical leave
$\square$ Conditions of work
- Predictable schedules, fair and safe environment, employee voice
$\square$ Income stability
- Adequate hours, stable rate of pay


## Quality Jobs Initiative

- Informing policymakers
- \$15 issue brief
- PFML convening
- Promoting research
- Research consortium (Boston Fed, Harvard, MIT, Brandeis, UMass)
- Visiting scholar papers on public and societal costs of low-wage work
$\square \quad$ Invested magazine issues on scheduling and worker voice/engagement
- Influencing funds to focus on job quality, not just job creation
$\square$ Employer engagement partnership with the MA labor department and Commonwealth Corp.


## Good Jobs, Good Business?

- Zeynep Ton shows that that a Good Jobs Strategy can be effective in lowcost industries such as retail. Examples: Costco, Trader Joes, QuikTrip

- Recent Gap study shows increased sales in stores where managers were encouraged to provide more consistent schedules.


## Concluding Observations

$\square$ Expansion of low-wage jobs mirrors national trends.
$\square$ Low-wage jobs have significant public costs.
$\square$ Low-wage workforce does not match common assumptions.
$\square$ Stronger labor market creates opportunity for improving quality of jobs.
$\square$ Policy makers, employers and financial intermediaries all have a role.

